

# City of Muskegon

## Bid Comparison

---

**Contract ID:** H92507  
**Description:** Western Ave Mill  
**Location:** Western Ave  
**Projects(s):** H92507

---

Rank	Bidder	Total Bid	% Over Low	% Over Est.
0	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE	\$462,625.00	-24.14%	0.00%
1	(00529) Michigan Paving and Materials Company	\$609,849.95	0.00%	31.82%
2	(02123) Brenner Excavating, Inc.	\$665,894.03	9.18%	43.93%
3	(00253) Rieth-Riley Construction Co., Inc.	\$725,142.95	18.90%	56.74%
4	(05076) McCormick Sand, Inc.	\$838,221.95	37.44%	81.18%

---

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		(1) Michigan Paving and Materials Company		(2) Brenner Excavating, Inc.	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0001	1100001	1	LSUM	\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00
	Mobilization, Max								
0002	2040020	698	Ft	\$9.84	\$6,868.32	\$38.00	\$26,524.00	\$10.50	\$7,329.00
	Curb and Gutter, Rem								
0003	2040055	42	Syd	\$12.89	\$541.38	\$45.00	\$1,890.00	\$7.50	\$315.00
	Sidewalk, Rem								
0004	2050016	20	Cyd	\$14.00	\$280.00	\$100.00	\$2,000.00	\$0.01	\$0.20
	Excavation, Earth								
0005	2080020	49	Ea	\$130.00	\$6,370.00	\$150.00	\$7,350.00	\$115.00	\$5,635.00
	Erosion Control, Inlet Protection, Fabric Drop								
0006	3020001	20	Ton	\$30.00	\$600.00	\$100.00	\$2,000.00	\$0.01	\$0.20
	Aggregate Base								
0007	4030004	26	Ea	\$1,067.00	\$27,742.00	\$850.00	\$22,100.00	\$1,250.00	\$32,500.00
	Dr Structure Cover, Adj, Case 1, Modified								
0008	4030010	26	Ea	\$650.00	\$16,900.00	\$750.00	\$19,500.00	\$975.00	\$25,350.00
	Dr Structure Cover, Type B								
0009	5010002	11,428	Syd	\$8.00	\$91,424.00	\$3.75	\$42,855.00	\$3.30	\$37,712.40
	Cold Milling HMA Surface								
0010	5010025	30	Ton	\$130.00	\$3,900.00	\$272.74	\$8,182.20	\$310.00	\$9,300.00
	Hand Patching								
0011	5012025	1,650	Ton	\$95.00	\$156,750.00	\$150.00	\$247,500.00	\$170.00	\$280,500.00
	HMA, 4EML								
0012	8020002	662	Ft	\$30.00	\$19,860.00	\$35.50	\$23,501.00	\$47.00	\$31,114.00
	Curb, Conc, Det E2								
0013	8020038	50	Ft	\$26.00	\$1,300.00	\$43.90	\$2,195.00	\$50.50	\$2,525.00
	Curb and Gutter, Conc, Det F4								
0014	8030030	32	Ft	\$32.00	\$1,024.00	\$43.90	\$1,404.80	\$47.00	\$1,504.00
	Curb Ramp Opening, Conc								

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		(1) Michigan Paving and Materials Company		(2) Brenner Excavating, Inc.	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0015	8030044	205	Sft	\$4.80	\$984.00	\$7.80	\$1,599.00	\$14.00	\$2,870.00
	Sidewalk, Conc, 4 inch								
0016	8032003	170	Sft	\$10.00	\$1,700.00	\$12.00	\$2,040.00	\$22.00	\$3,740.00
	Curb Ramp, Conc, 7 inch								
0017	8110024	886	Ft	\$4.90	\$4,341.40	\$6.00	\$5,316.00	\$5.65	\$5,005.90
	Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, 6 inch, Crosswalk								
0018	8110044	262	Ft	\$10.00	\$2,620.00	\$18.00	\$4,716.00	\$17.00	\$4,454.00
	Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, 18 inch, Stop Bar								
0019	8110063	7	Ea	\$158.00	\$1,106.00	\$250.00	\$1,750.00	\$339.00	\$2,373.00
	Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, Lt Turn Arrow Sym								
0020	8110231	260	Ft	\$0.10	\$26.00	\$0.70	\$182.00	\$0.56	\$145.60
	Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, White								
0021	8110232	3,858	Ft	\$0.10	\$385.80	\$0.70	\$2,700.60	\$0.56	\$2,160.48
	Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, Yellow								
0022	8117001	2,984	Ft	\$1.50	\$4,476.00	\$2.05	\$6,117.20	\$4.50	\$13,428.00
	_ Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, For On-Street Parking, 4 Inch, White								
0023	8120012	29	Ea	\$85.00	\$2,465.00	\$75.00	\$2,175.00	\$84.80	\$2,459.20
	Barricade, Type III, High Intensity, Double Sided, Lighted, Furn								
0024	8120013	29	Ea	\$1.00	\$29.00	\$5.00	\$145.00	\$5.65	\$163.85
	Barricade, Type III, High Intensity, Double Sided, Lighted, Oper								
0025	8120026	16	Ea	\$80.00	\$1,280.00	\$100.00	\$1,600.00	\$113.00	\$1,808.00
	Pedestrian Type II Barricade, Temp								
0026	8120140	1	Ea	\$480.00	\$480.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$565.00	\$565.00
	Lighted Arrow, Type C, Furn								
0027	8120141	1	Ea	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$113.00	\$113.00
	Lighted Arrow, Type C, Oper								
0028	8120170	1	LSUM	\$4,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$42,500.00	\$42,500.00
	Minor Traf Devices								
0029	8120252	175	Ea	\$32.00	\$5,600.00	\$22.00	\$3,850.00	\$24.90	\$4,357.50
	Plastic Drum, Fluorescent, Furn								

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		(1) Michigan Paving and Materials Company		(2) Brenner Excavating, Inc.	
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0030	8120350	817	Sft	\$4.50	\$3,676.50	\$4.00	\$3,268.00	\$4.50	\$3,676.50
	Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Furn								
0031	8120351	817	Sft	\$1.00	\$817.00	\$1.00	\$817.00	\$1.15	\$939.55
	Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Oper								
0032	8129000	175	Ea	\$1.00	\$175.00	\$35.00	\$6,125.00	\$39.60	\$6,930.00
	Plastic Drum, Damage								
0033	8237050	10	Ea	\$1,200.00	\$12,000.00	\$1,800.00	\$18,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$40,000.00
	_ Water Valve Box and Cover, Complete								
0034	8507001	30	Ft	\$100.00	\$3,000.00	\$85.00	\$2,550.00	\$203.50	\$6,105.00
	_ Detectable Warning Surface, cast Iron Spec								
0035	8507001	201	Ft	\$1.60	\$321.60	\$2.15	\$432.15	\$5.65	\$1,135.65
	_ Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, For On-Street Parking, 4 Inch, Blue								
0036	8507011	4,220	Syd	\$0.60	\$2,532.00	\$1.75	\$7,385.00	\$2.00	\$8,440.00
	_ Seal, Slurry								
0037	8507050	94	Ea	\$200.00	\$18,800.00	\$110.00	\$10,340.00	\$124.50	\$11,703.00
	_ Casting Safety Ramp								
0038	8507050	12	Ea	\$350.00	\$4,200.00	\$95.00	\$1,140.00	\$678.00	\$8,136.00
	_ Pavt Mrk, Ovly Cold Plastic, Accessible Sym, Blue								
0039	8507050	2	Ea	\$2,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$2,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$2,950.00	\$5,900.00
	_ Traf Loop								
0040	8507051	1	LSUM	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00
	_ Project Cleanup, Modified								
<b>Bid Totals:</b>					<b>\$462,625.00</b>		<b>\$609,849.95</b>		<b>\$665,894.03</b>

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(3) Rieth-Riley Construction Co., Inc.		(4) McCormick Sand, Inc.			
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total
0001	1100001	1	LSUM	\$40,200.00	\$40,200.00	\$83,000.00	\$83,000.00		\$0.00
	Mobilization, Max								
0002	2040020	698	Ft	\$10.00	\$6,980.00	\$20.00	\$13,960.00		\$0.00
	Curb and Gutter, Rem								
0003	2040055	42	Syd	\$30.00	\$1,260.00	\$20.00	\$840.00		\$0.00
	Sidewalk, Rem								
0004	2050016	20	Cyd	\$45.00	\$900.00	\$20.00	\$400.00		\$0.00
	Excavation, Earth								
0005	2080020	49	Ea	\$200.00	\$9,800.00	\$150.00	\$7,350.00		\$0.00
	Erosion Control, Inlet Protection, Fabric Drop								
0006	3020001	20	Ton	\$60.00	\$1,200.00	\$40.00	\$800.00		\$0.00
	Aggregate Base								
0007	4030004	26	Ea	\$1,750.00	\$45,500.00	\$1,850.00	\$48,100.00		\$0.00
	Dr Structure Cover, Adj, Case 1, Modified								
0008	4030010	26	Ea	\$750.00	\$19,500.00	\$850.00	\$22,100.00		\$0.00
	Dr Structure Cover, Type B								
0009	5010002	11,428	Syd	\$6.00	\$68,568.00	\$8.50	\$97,138.00		\$0.00
	Cold Milling HMA Surface								
0010	5010025	30	Ton	\$662.00	\$19,860.00	\$250.00	\$7,500.00		\$0.00
	Hand Patching								
0011	5012025	1,650	Ton	\$215.20	\$355,080.00	\$164.00	\$270,600.00		\$0.00
	HMA, 4EML								
0012	8020002	662	Ft	\$18.00	\$11,916.00	\$30.00	\$19,860.00		\$0.00
	Curb, Conc, Det E2								
0013	8020038	50	Ft	\$14.00	\$700.00	\$40.00	\$2,000.00		\$0.00
	Curb and Gutter, Conc, Det F4								
0014	8030030	32	Ft	\$18.00	\$576.00	\$40.00	\$1,280.00		\$0.00
	Curb Ramp Opening, Conc								
0015	8030044	205	Sft	\$10.00	\$2,050.00	\$11.00	\$2,255.00		\$0.00
	Sidewalk, Conc, 4 inch								
0016	8032003	170	Sft	\$18.00	\$3,060.00	\$13.00	\$2,210.00		\$0.00
	Curb Ramp, Conc, 7 inch								

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(3) Rieth-Riley Construction Co., Inc.		(4) McCormick Sand, Inc.		Bid Price	Total
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total		
0017	8110024	886	Ft	\$6.00	\$5,316.00	\$6.00	\$5,316.00		\$0.00
	Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, 6 inch, Crosswalk								
0018	8110044	262	Ft	\$18.00	\$4,716.00	\$18.00	\$4,716.00		\$0.00
	Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, 18 inch, Stop Bar								
0019	8110063	7	Ea	\$250.00	\$1,750.00	\$250.00	\$1,750.00		\$0.00
	Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, Lt Turn Arrow Sym								
0020	8110231	260	Ft	\$0.70	\$182.00	\$0.70	\$182.00		\$0.00
	Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, White								
0021	8110232	3,858	Ft	\$0.70	\$2,700.60	\$0.70	\$2,700.60		\$0.00
	Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, Yellow								
0022	8117001	2,984	Ft	\$2.05	\$6,117.20	\$2.05	\$6,117.20		\$0.00
	Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, For On-Street Parking, 4 inch, White								
0023	8120012	29	Ea	\$75.00	\$2,175.00	\$75.00	\$2,175.00		\$0.00
	Barricade, Type III, High Intensity, Double Sided, Lighted, Furn								
0024	8120013	29	Ea	\$5.00	\$145.00	\$5.00	\$145.00		\$0.00
	Barricade, Type III, High Intensity, Double Sided, Lighted, Oper								
0025	8120026	16	Ea	\$100.00	\$1,600.00	\$100.00	\$1,600.00		\$0.00
	Pedestrian Type II Barricade, Temp								
0026	8120140	1	Ea	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$500.00		\$0.00
	Lighted Arrow, Type C, Furn								
0027	8120141	1	Ea	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$100.00		\$0.00
	Lighted Arrow, Type C, Oper								
0028	8120170	1	LSUM	\$30,500.00	\$30,500.00	\$149,200.00	\$149,200.00		\$0.00
	Minor Traf Devices								
0029	8120252	175	Ea	\$22.00	\$3,850.00	\$22.00	\$3,850.00		\$0.00
	Plastic Drum, Fluorescent, Furn								
0030	8120350	817	Sft	\$4.00	\$3,268.00	\$4.00	\$3,268.00		\$0.00
	Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Furn								
0031	8120351	817	Sft	\$1.00	\$817.00	\$1.00	\$817.00		\$0.00
	Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Oper								

Line	Pay Item Code	Quantity	Units	(3) Rieth-Riley Construction Co., Inc.		(4) McCormick Sand, Inc.		Bid Price	Total
				Bid Price	Total	Bid Price	Total		
0032	8129000	175	Ea	\$35.00	\$6,125.00	\$35.00	\$6,125.00		\$0.00
	Plastic Drum, Damage								
0033	8237050	10	Ea	\$1,200.00	\$12,000.00	\$1,850.00	\$18,500.00		\$0.00
	_ Water Valve Box and Cover, Complete								
0034	8507001	30	Ft	\$55.00	\$1,650.00	\$110.00	\$3,300.00		\$0.00
	_ Detectable Warning Surface, cast Iron Spec								
0035	8507001	201	Ft	\$2.15	\$432.15	\$2.15	\$432.15		\$0.00
	_ Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, For On-Street Parking, 4 Inch, Blue								
0036	8507011	4,220	Syd	\$4.75	\$20,045.00	\$3.25	\$13,715.00		\$0.00
	_ Seal, Slurry								
0037	8507050	94	Ea	\$206.00	\$19,364.00	\$100.00	\$9,400.00		\$0.00
	_ Casting Safety Ramp								
0038	8507050	12	Ea	\$95.00	\$1,140.00	\$95.00	\$1,140.00		\$0.00
	_ Pavt Mrk, Ovly Cold Plastic, Accessible Sym, Blue								
0039	8507050	2	Ea	\$2,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$2,500.00	\$5,000.00		\$0.00
	_ Traf Loop								
0040	8507051	1	LSUM	\$8,500.00	\$8,500.00	\$18,780.00	\$18,780.00		\$0.00
	_ Project Cleanup, Modified								
<b>Bid Totals:</b>				<b>\$725,142.95</b>		<b>\$838,221.95</b>			